Interventions



CAESURAE: POETICS OF CULTURAL TRANSLATION

Volume 5: 2

(ISSN 2454 -9495)

July 2023

Dharma, Ethics, Morality and Religion: the nuances of translations, mistranslations and non-translatables

*Snigdha Mondal and **Anuradha Choudry

Abstract: The concept of *dharma*, central to the Indic worldview is characterized by a ubiquitous presence across social, legal, religious and philosophical thought of India. It, being a multi- layered Sanskrit non-translatable word, conveys different ideas such as duty, conduct, ethics, character, law, morality, justice, custom, virtue, religion. The concepts of dharma, ethics and morality and religion are often used synonymously in literature and in practice and are regarded as important pillars of society which determine the lives of individuals. *Dharma*, a Sanskrit term, is regarded as one of the four goals of life or puruṣārthas that acts as a foundation of Indian philosophy and is a common thread which binds the wide range of philosophical schools in India into a single unifying identity. On the other hand, ethics and morality are English terms which have a similar foundational role in the Western context, where ethics deals with the philosophical reflections on human conduct and helps to guide our behaviour, choices and actions while morality refers to the social norms, beliefs and practices in the society which people are conditioned to follow. The concept of religion also has a Western connotation which binds human beings to each other in the bonds of love and sympathy. The notions of dharma, ethics and morality and religion are different constructs in their own right but they are often used interchangeably. This article aims at understanding the exact relationship between the term *dharma* and the other three concepts.

Keywords: dharma, translation, ethics, morality, religion

Introduction

Dharma, ethics, morality and religion are concepts that have acted as important guidelines for regulating individual and collective existence in Indian and Western contexts respectively. Dharma, a key concept of the Indic worldview is regarded as one the four goals of life or puruṣārthas, the others being artha (wealth), kāma (desires), mokṣa (liberation). It has also been described as 'the structural power that holds things together and arranges them into a meaningful cosmos' (Mittal & Thursby, 2006). It refers to the balance and order which governs the entire universe (Das, 2009). The word dharma comes from the Sanskrit root-

word *dhr*, which means to support, sustain and uphold (Kane, 1930). Dharma, a multi-layered Sanskrit non-translatable word, conveys different ideas such as duty, conduct, character, law, morality, justice, custom, virtue, religion. In Hinduism, the notion of *dharma* underwent significant changes from that of ritualistic sacrifices to that of rules and codes of conduct for society and even as means to attain *Brahman* (Bowker, 2020). The modern use of the word is also synonymous with religion. The meaning attributed to this term has high degree of fluidity, but the core idea of dharma as asserted by various texts is *varṇāśramadharma*, which often indicates the duties of individuals living in society according to their *varṇas - brāhmaṇa, kṣatrīya, vaiśya, śūdra*. It also talks about the four stages of a person's life - *brahmacārin, gṛhasthin, vāṇaprasthin, sannyāsin* (Glucklich, 2005). Broadly speaking, there are two types of *dharmas -* the universal *dharma* and the individual *dharma* and a balanced functioning between the two is needed to preserve and restore the cosmic order. Every single inhabitant in society is layered with multiple *dharmas* and it is for one to identify that particular *dharma* which requires urgent attention and thereby act accordingly.

To fulfill one's own duty is regarded as the highest dharma. The Hindu philosophy which is known as the *Sanātana Dharma* took recourse to *dharma* as its founding principle whereas western philosophy had ethics as its foundation. The word ethics has its inception in the Greek *ethos* which means 'character' (Gulcan, 2015). Generally speaking, ethics refers to a 'way of life', 'moral codes' of conduct and using reason to question them (Abelson & Nielsen, 1967). Ethics dealt with two fundamental questions – 'What ought we to do?' and 'Why ought we to do it?' (Perrett, 1998 in Dhand, 2002: 349).

Ethics provided rational explanations to the issues of right and wrong, good and bad. The philosophy of ethics also underwent an evolutionary process where the primary focus was on the 'good life' based on virtue using reason and logic. Then it shifted to 'moral duty' centered on reason and even ethics was seen in the utilitarian light of 'producing the greatest possible happiness' (Goree, 2020).

Morality comes from the word moral which is derived from the Latin word *mores* meaning manners and customs (Goree, 2020 & Gulcan, 2015). Morality sets up social norms for people to follow while ethics applies reason to question those norms. Ethics is 'the branch of philosophy that systematically studies moral ideals and goals, motives of choice, and patternsof good and bad conduct'. On the other hand, in a descriptive sense, morality is used

to state or describe the codes of conduct theoretically, which in turn is used by society to ascertain what is right or wrong. In the normative sense of the word, it is used more reflectively to consider 'what', 'how', 'why' of particular codes of conduct and how they can be put to proper practice by procreating these codes of conduct in individuals living in society (Gert & Gert, 2020).

The word religion in Christianity is derived from the Latin word *re* and *legere* or *ligare* which means to bind back; that which binds human beings to each other in the bonds of love and sympathy (Krisha Murthy, 1996). The concept of religion is God centric, focusing on the teachings of God and relationship between man and God and is accompanied by the exclusive religious texts which are enforcing in nature.

The terms dharma, ethics, morality and religion belong to two different cultures - Eastern (Indic) and Western pertaining to their respective worldviews. In literature, these terms are often used interchangeably. Dharma, a Sanskrit term, is often referred to in English as ethics, morality and religion. In fact, as mentioned above, the term dharma is variously translated using several words with ethics, morality and religion being the most frequent substitutes.

Dharma

Dharma, the concept which defines Indian philosophy, is referred to as 'India's word to the world' (Besant, 1918). The word dharma comes from the Sanskrit root-word *dhr*, which means to support, sustain and uphold. It refers to the balance which governs the entire universe. Dharma is an exclusive Indian concept which has been absorbed by all (Billimoria, 1993). Dharma is the principle which integrates the whole universe both in the physical sense as cosmic order and in the moral sense as the rules and regulations presiding over human society (Bhattacharya, 1992). The word dharma lies outside the confinements of definition due to its multifarious layers of meaning (Ayengar, 1952). The word dharma is untranslatable and lacks its suitable terminology in other languages. Dharma is defined as 'that which is established or firm, steadfast decree, status, ordinance, law; usage, practice, customary observance or prescribed conduct, duty; right, justice (often as a synonym of punishment); virtue, morality, religion, religious merit, good works...' (Monier-Williams, 1976). To use Gilbert Ryle's expression, dharma is a 'polymorphous concept', like 'work' or 'thinking'

(Pappu, 2004). This speaks volumes of its multiple layers of meaning and the multiple senses in which it is used: such as dharma, as law of things, being as they are, as moral order, as the sum of duties, as the object of pursuit, as religion, as cosmic order, as ethics, as bhakti, as divine justice, as law, as good deeds, as identical with God or the Absolute, as a person (Sankar, 2007).

Ethics

Etymologically, the word ethics comes from the Greek word *ethos* meaning custom or character (Gulcan, 2015). The Oxford English Dictionary describes ethics as 'moral principles that govern a person's behaviour or the conducting of an activity (the moral correctness of a specified conduct); the branch of knowledge that deals with moral principles.' The word ethics is described in distinct but interrelated ways- 'a general patternor "way of life"; a set of rules of conduct or "moral code"; inquiry about ways of life and rules of conduct' (Abelson & Nielsen, 1967). Ethics is a branch of philosophy whose main concern is moral ideals and goals, motives of choice and patterns of good and bad conduct (Goree, 2020).

Ethics deals with the systematic analysis of comprehending the evaluation of conduct rationally. It deals with the philosophical reflections of human conduct and helps to guide our behaviour, choices and actions (Lee, 1928). The most important factor in ethics is to voluntarily follow the 'dictates of reason' in determining the rightfulness or wrongfulness of an action with the hope of bringing out the highest good (Lee 1928, Weiss 1942). The basic criteria of ethics are to voluntarily choose and follow the universal good (Weiss, 1942).

'Ethics is the philosophic investigation of the broad field of morals', as morals and morality together constitute a section in the whole subject area of ethics (Lee, 1928). An ethical person, through rational thinking about the way of life he/she is going to live and keeping in mind the 'ideal good', deliberately makes certain choices with respect to his action or conduct (Lee 1928, Weiss 1942). This underscores the basic fact that ethics is the fundamental principle in society which strives to work for the good and welfare of all and is instrumental in building a cohesive society.

Morality

The concepts of morality and moral order are recurrent ideas in western thought. Jonathan Haidt's *Morality* (2008) explores the relevance of morality and moral insights and also refers to the fact that it spanned the entire history of Western Philosophy. John Hare's *Religion and*

Morality (2019) proves instrumental in tracing moral philosophy across different eras. The word morality is derived from the Latin word mores which refers to customs and manners (Gulcan, 2015). The lexical definition of the term morality as provided by the Oxford English Dictionary is 'the principle of distinction between good and bad, right and wrong behaviour and a system of values or principles of conduct' (Choudhury, 2010). But the definition of morality is not limited to the concept of differentiation between right and wrong and should not be taken at face value as the very idea of morality is multi-layered and complex. The word is sometimes described in terms of its opposite word immorality in the context of depicting an action and is used as an apparatus for chastisement of behaviour.

RS Duval in *Encyclopedia of Ethics* explains morality 'as beliefs and practices related to the notion of right conduct which is accepted or sanctioned according to some particular system' (Choudhury, 2010). This underlines the crucial fact that morality is sanctioned conduct. Morality is a body of accepted conduct where reason has not been a very favourable component in the growth of moralities (Lee, 1928). The 'basic rule' in morality is 'to do as others do'. Weiss also talks about the diversity of 'moral codes' which 'vary and ought to vary from place to place and time to time.' This diversity and acceptance of diversity also points to another fact that morality is relative which helps to accommodate the differences and respect the fineness of some moralities over 'others' that can lead us to 'approximating more closely to the status of an ideal social whole' (Weiss, 1942). Morality is being referred to as the narrow field of concerns and is one of the several approaches to the ethical (Blum, 2005).

Religion

The word religion in Christianity is derived from the Latin word *re* and *legere* or *ligare* which means to bind back (Krishna Murthy, 1996). The concept of religion has been defined as beliefs, cultural values. It is also described as a discourse which revolves around the dialectics of religion - the preachings, literary oeuvres. Religion is 'both a symptom and a cause of alienation' thereby prescribing both an ideology and contributing to the formation of identity. It also serves as the reservoir of memory for people to fall back on difficult times (Woodhead, 2011). Religion on the one hand has been a Western ideological apparatus - a powertool to propagate Western supremacy onto the other parts of the world weaving a web of oppression and domination. On the other hand, religion helps to instill a sense of shared feeling thereby creating a sense of unity. A religion comes with its own rituals, cult, practices

as well as its superstitions. This proves that it is community/group specific and not universal. James defines religion as 'the feelings, acts, and experiences of individual men in their solitude, so far as they apprehend themselves to stand in relation to whatever they may consider the divine' (cited in Lazenby, 2010). Religion is also a social institution to create a sense of order in society either through devotion or fear.

Dharma-ethics, dharma-morality and dharma-religion

The concept of dharma has certain fixed definitions in texts belonging to Indic literature such as *Rgveda* and *Mahābhārata*. There are a significant number of writers who tried to equate the concept of dharma to that of ethics and morality and religion. '*Dharma* is the central ethical concept in the post-Vedic Indian thought, and it is the comprehensive ethical category in the light of which alone the rest of the ethical ideals can be understood' (Ravi, 2002). Dharma indicates 'ethical good usage' and 'implies in itself a code of conduct to avoid all crimes, murder, adultery, theft, etc., to avoid less spiritual sins, arrogance, envy, jealousy and ... all injury to others' (Hopkins, 1924). Dharma is synonymous to ethics in its social sense (Sankar, 2007). Dharma 'comprises the whole context of religious and moral duties' (Zimmer, 1990). Dharma is the moral pursuit of man and has to be followed in all human endeavours (Sankar, 2007).

However, P.V. Kane (1930, 1941) writes that 'the concern of the writers of *Dharmasastras* was not predominantly ethical theory, but the practical guidance of people in everyday life with reference to their station in society' (I.I.4; II.I.11). This points to the fact that the Dharmasastras, considered as a very vital source of dharma, are often misunderstood as 'ethical and moral texts.' This reflects the misconceptions or preconceived notions about dharma which is taken to be exactly similar to the concepts of ethics and morality. Hacker and Davis (2006) refer to points of contact between the Indic concept of dharma with Western concepts such as *eusebeia* and religion. Ashoka's notion of dharma bears resemblance to the Greek *eusebeia* as both refer to duty or a code of conduct towards all humanity. But despite their resemblance, these two words cannot be equated with each other. In the recent times, where the 'Indic words are used to express European concepts while writing in Indic languages, dharma is seen now as an equivalent for the European word religion.' The problem in equating dharma with either *eusebeia* or with religion is that 'both concepts overlap without coinciding.' This underscores the dilemma of simplistic translations

being imposed on a certain culture. The meaning of a particular word can be determined by its opposite which in turn can help in finding its equivalent in other literature. But the opposite of dharma is adharma, which is a multi - layered word like dharma itself and is subjected to various shades of meaning.

As mentioned earlier, according to Krishna Murthy (1996) religion in Christianity means to bind back; that which binds human beings to each other in the bonds of love and sympathy. The corresponding vedic word is dharma from *dhr* to hold and bind together, which has the exact same significance' (84). The term religion, as Jonathan Z. Smith points out, bears the connotation of being an academically constructed term during the course of its evolution which became a concept so endearing to the 'Western religious polemics and apologetics' (Olson, 2006: 267). The Western term religion has often been used as a tool of identification and demarcation by the colonial powers to categorize the people of India into various sects (Hinduism, Buddhism, Jainism) which were otherwise unified by the common concept of dharma. As Olson notes, 'it is very probable that there was no need to give it a name except for the benefit of outsiders' (here outsiders signify the British authority) (268). According to Sri Aurobindo, the word religion "smacks too much of things external such as creeds, rites, an external piety; there is no one Indian equivalent" (Aurobindo, 2019).

The various religious sects come along with their own personalized rituals which form a part and parcel of dharma rather than comprising the whole of it. One amongst the various meanings of dharma in the *Rgveda* is in the form of 'religious ordinances or rites' (*I.22.18*, *V.26.6*, *VIII.43.24*, *IX.64.1*). The concept of dharma is 'universal', 'rooted in both what is seen and what is unseen' whereas the 'religious sects rely upon the personal experiences of the prophets and variations in their perspectives and tastes' (Jois, 29). It is a way of life and not confined to one particular source and is therefore non-binding in nature. It has diverse sources like the Vedas, Upanisads, Dharmasastras. Therefore, the notion of dharma, being an all-encompassing term, includes religion as one of its various aspects. To conclude, dharma has often been synonymously used within one single breath with the concept of religion but the canopy term dharma shelters religious understanding as one amongst its multifaceted interpretations. Talking about Sri Aurobindo's opinion about the rebirth of India, Michel Danino (2020) writes that 'wrongly equating Dharma with religion has resulted in divorcing Dharma from national life, which can be done only at the risk of losing what has held this

nation together: diversity without the unifying center provided by Dharma is a sure road to fragmentation' (240).

The misconception about the terms dharma and religion being equivalent to each other resulted in the frequent mundane confusion between the concepts of sanatana dharma and Hindu dharma. The idea of sanatana dharma which also goes by the name vedic dharma first appears in the *Rgveda* (*III.3.1*) as the 'ancient ordinances' (Kane, Vol I, 1, 2). The axiomatic reference to Hindu dharma has its inception in Hinduism, an imposed 'construct' by the West with 'imperialist connotations' (Lipner, 2004: 13,14).

According to Radhakrishnan, dharma is 'the stable condition, capable of giving perfect satisfaction to man and of helping him in the attainment of happiness and salvation. Its end, according to him, is the welfare of all creation (quoted in Sankar, 2007: 60, 61). While sanatana dharma or the ancient universal dharma involves the recognition of an ideal worldview/way of life and its manifestation in the form of *abhyudaya* (well-being) and *nisreyasa* (liberation), the phrase Hindu dharma 'has been made to serve an imperialistic ideal - giving a common name to everything that exists within ritual and sacred boundaries of the Motherland or the Nation' (Frykenberg, 1993: 533). This brings us to a conclusion that the Hindu dharma, a product of colonialist tendencies which has its foundational framework on the Western concept of religion, is either a branching out or a reductionist abstraction of the ancient sanatana dharma.

Conclusion

Within the difficult list of 'Sanskrit non-translatables' propounded by Rajiv Malhotra in his book 'Being Different' (2011), the term dharma has rightfully earned a place alongside similar cognates like karma, moksa, atman etcetera. This elucidates the fundamental nature of the term dharma which restricts itself from getting absorbed into other languages. This word is an umbrella term for many different concepts like religion, ethics, duty, law, morality and this all-inclusive nature prevents it from getting reduced to any single equivalent. It has often been equated with the above Western concepts though no English word has been potent enough to carry the 'transcendent element of the word dharma', a fact which underscores the problem of simplistic translations being imposed on a certain culture (Fitzgerald, 680). Even Austin Creel is of the opinion that dharma should not be equated with any Western word just for the sake of translation as 'premature identification with Western concepts tends to blind

one to the particular multifaceted structure of meanings' within the term dharma (quoted in Holdrege, 213). The immense scope that this term possesses enveloping various concepts in various senses, bears testimony to the fact that no single word is competent enough to capture its multi-dimensional aspects. But the word dharma will continue to remain pertinent throughout blexical and conceptual *odyssey* by accommodating more such concepts within its embrace.

References

- Abelson, R., & Nielsen, K. (n.d.). "History of ethics". *Encyclopedia of Philosophy*. https://www.encyclopedia.com/humanities/encyclopedias-almanacstranscripts and-maps/ethics-history (16 October 2020).
- Aurobindo, Sri. *The Renaissance in India and Other Essays on Indian Culture*. Pondicherry: Sri Aurobindo Ashram Publication Department, 2019.
- Ayengar, K.V. R. Some aspects of the Hindu view of life according to the dharmasastras. Oriental Institute, 1952.
- Besant, A. *Dharma*. Chennai: The Theosophical Publishing House, 1918.
- Bhattacharya, M. *Moral dilemma in Indian scriptures a critical study* [Doctoral Dissertation, Jadavpur University]. Shodhganga, 2009.

 http://hdl.handle.net/10603/160633.
- Billimoria, P. "Indian Ethics". In P. Singer (Ed.), *A Companion to Ethics*. Blackwell. 1993.
- Blum, L. "Ethics and morality". *Encyclopedia of Philosophy*, 2005. Retrieved

 October 16,2020, from https: www.encyclopedia.com/humanities/encyclopedias-almanacs- transcripts andmaps/ethics-and-morality.
- Bowker, J. (n.d.). "Dharma". *The concise oxford dictionary of world religions*. Oxford University Press. Retrieved October 16, 2020, from https://www.encyclopedia.com/religion/dictionariesthesauruses-pictures-and-press-releases/dharma-0.
- Choudhury, S.A. Contemporary debate on morality of ends and means [Doctoral Dissertation, Aligarh Muslim University]. Shodhganga, 2010.http://hdl.handle.net/10603/11259 Cranston, M., & Jessop. T.E. (Ed.). (n.d.). David Hume. In Britannica. Encyclopedia Britannica. Retrieved November 23,

- 2020, fromhttps://www.britannica.com/biography/David Hum
- Danino, M. "Sri Aurobindo's Vision of India's Rebirth". *The Philosophy of Sri Aurobindo*, edited by Debidatta Aurobinda Mahapatra, 233-248. New Delhi: BloomsburyIndia, 2020, pp. 233-248.
- Das, G. The difficulty of being good: On the subtle art of dharma. Penguin Books, 2009.
- Dhand, A. "The dharma of ethics, the ethics of dharma: Quizzing the ideals of Hinduism". *The Journal of Religious Ethics*, 2002, 30(3), pp. 347-372. https://www.jstor.org/stable/40018090
- Doniger, W. (Ed.). (n.d.). Bhagavadgita. *In Britannica*. Encyclopedia Britannica.

 Retrieved November 22, 2020, from https://www.britannica.com/topic/Bhagavadgita
- Fitzgerald, J.L. "Dharma" and its translation in the Mahabharata". *Journal of Indian Philosophy* 2004, 32(5/6), pp. 671-685. Accessed 29 May 2021.

 https://www.jstor.org/stable/23497157.
- Frykenberg, R.E. "Constructions of Hinduism at the Nexus of History and Religion". *The Journal of Interdisciplinary History*, 1993, 23(3), pp. 523-550. Accessed 29 May 2021. https://www.jstor.org/stable/206101.
- Gert, B., & Gert, J. (n.d.). "The definition of morality". In E. N. Zalta (Ed.), *The Stanford Encyclopedia of Philosophy*. Stanford University. Retrieved December 18, 2020, from https://plato.stanford.edu/archives/fall2020/entries/morality-definition.
- Glucklich, A. "Dharma: Hindu dharma". *Encyclopedia of Religion*, 2005. Retrieved October 17, 2020, from https://www.encyclopedia.com/environment/encyclopedias-almanacs-transcripts andmaps/dharma-hindu-dharma
- Goree, K. (n.d.). "Ethics: An overview". *Encyclopedia of Business and Finance* (2nd Ed.).

 Retrieved October 16, 2020, from https://www.encyclopedia.com/finance/finance-and-accounting magazines/ethics-overview.
- Gulcan, N. Y. "Discussing the importance of teaching ethics in education". *Elsevier Ltd*, 2015, pp. 2622- 2625. http://doi.org/10.1016/j.sbspro.2015.01.942
- Hacker, P., & Davis, D. "Dharma in Hinduism". *Journal of Indian Philosophy*, 2006, 34(5), pp. 479- 496. http://www.jstor.org/stable/23497312.
- Haidt, J. Morality. *Perspectives on Psychological Science*, 2008, 3(1), pp. 65-72. https://www.jstor.org/stable/40212229.

- Hare, J. (n.d.). "Religion and morality". In E. N. Zalta (Ed.), *The Stanford Encyclopedia of Philosophy*. Stanford University. Retrieved December 18, 2020, from https://plato.stanford.edu/archives/fall2019/entries/religion morality.
- Holdrege, B. "Dharma". *The Hindu World*, edited by Sushil Mittal and Gene Thursby, 2005, pp. 213-248. New York & London: Routledge.
- Hopkins, E.W. Ethics of India. Yale University Press, 1924.
- Jois, M.D. Dharma: The Universal Foundation of Life.
- Kane, P. V. *History of Dharmashastra* (Vol. I). Bhandarkar Oriental Research Institute, 1930.
- . History of Dharmashastra (Vol. II). Bhandarkar Oriental Research Institute, 1941.
- Krishna Murthy, K. "Dharma Its Etymology". *The Tibet Journal*, 1996, 21(1), pp. 84-87. Accessed 31 Dec 2020. https://www.jstor.org/stable/43300563.
- Lazenby, J.M. On "spirituality," "religion," and "religions": A concept analysis. *Palliative and. Supportive Care*, 2010, 8, pp. 469–476, doi:10.1017/S1478951510000374.
- Lee, H. N. Morals, morality, and ethics: Suggested terminology. *International Journal of Ethics*, 1928, 38(4), pp. 450-466. https://www.jstor.org/stable/2377964.
- Lipner, J. "On Hinduism and Hinduisms: The Way of the Banyan". *The Hindu* World, edited by Sushil Mittal and Gene Thursby, New York and London: Routledge, 2004, pp. 9-34.
- Malhotra, R. *Being Different: An Indian Challenge to Western Universalism. India*. India: Harper Collins, 2011.
- Mittal, S., & Thursby, G.R. (Ed.). *Religions of South Asia: An introduction*. Routledge Taylor and Francis Group, 2006.
- Monier-Williams, M. Sanskrit-English Dictionary: Motilal Banarsidass, 1976, pp. 510.
- Olson, C. "Contested Categories and Issues in Interpretation". *Religions of South Asia*, edited by Sushil Mittal & Gene Thursby, London &New York: Routledge, 2006, pp. 263-286.

 Oxford University Press. (n.d.). "Ethics". In *Oxford English Online Dictionary*.

 Oxford University Press. Retrieved December 18, 2020, from https://en.Oxforddictionaries.com/definition/ethics.

- Pappu, S. S. R. R. "Hindu Ethics". In R. Rinehart (Ed.). *Contemporary Hinduism Ritual, Culture, and Practice*. ABC-CLIO, 2004.
- Ravi, I. Foundations of Indian ethics. Kaveri Books, 2002.
- Sankar, L. *The Concept of dharma in the Bhagavata Purana* [Doctoral Dissertation, Sree

 Sankaracharya University of Sanskrit]. Shodhganga, 2007.

 http://hdl.handle.net/10603/137697
- Weiss, P. "Morality and Ethics". *The Journal of Philosophy*, 1942, 39(14), pp. 381-385. https://doi.org/10.2307/2018625
- Woodhead, L. "Five Concepts of Religion". *International Review of Sociology*, 2011, 21(1), pp. 121-143, DOI: 10.1080/03906701.2011.544192.
- Zimmer, H. *Philosophies of India*. In J. Campbell (Ed.). Motilal Banarsidass Publishers Pvt. Ltd.1990.
- *Snigdha Mondal is a research scholar in the Humanities Department of Indian Institute of Technology, Kharagpur.
- **Anuradha Choudry is an Assistant Professor in the Humanities Department of Indian Institute of Technology, Kharagpur. She is also a core member of Indian Knowledge Systems, Ministry of Education, India.

Caesurae: Poetics of Cultural Translation, Vol 5: 2